



THE CITY OF BUFFALO
The City of Buffalo Preservation Board

901 City Hall

Minutes • December 7, 2017

Buffalo, NY 14202
<http://www.city-buffalo.com>
 Paul McDonnell

Regular

OSP Conference Room
 901 City Hall, 65 Niagara Sq., Buffalo, NY 14202

3:00 PM

I. Roll Call

Attendee Name	Present	Absent	Late	Arrived
Paul McDonnell	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Don Gilbert	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Sam Gurney	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Gwen Howard	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
John Laping	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Eric Lander	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Terrence Robinson	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	3:04 PM
Richard Lippes	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> Excused	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Ruth Bryant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	

II. Meeting Minutes

1. Preservation Board - Regular - Nov 16, 2017 3:00 PM

RESULT:	ACCEPTED [UNANIMOUS]
MOVER:	Sam Gurney
SECONDER:	Ruth Bryant
AYES:	McDonnell, Gilbert, Gurney, Laping, Lander, Bryant
ABSENT:	Gwen Howard, Terrence Robinson
EXCUSED:	Richard Lippes

III. Public Hearings

2. 469 & 471 Delaware Avenue - Demolish a Non-Original Rear Addition and Detached Garage in the Allentown Historic District.

RESULT:	TABLED [UNANIMOUS]
	Next: 12/21/2017 3:00 PM
MOVER:	Gwen Howard
SECONDER:	Sam Gurney
AYES:	McDonnell, Gilbert, Gurney, Howard, Laping, Lander, Robinson, Bryant
EXCUSED:	Richard Lippes

3. 58 Park Street - Demolish a Rear Garage in the Allentown Historic District.

The Preservation Board tabled the item to give the applicant an opportunity to present plans for replacement on the site of the deteriorated garage.

RESULT:	TABLED [7 TO 0]
	Next: 12/21/2017 3:00 PM
AYES:	McDonnell, Gilbert, Gurney, Howard, Laping, Lander, Bryant
ABSTAIN:	Terrence Robinson
EXCUSED:	Richard Lippes

IV. Communications

4. National Register of Historic Places - the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) Informs the Preservation Board that the Following Properties Will be Considered by the NYS Board for Historic Preservation for Nomination to the National Register of Historic Places at Its December 7, 2017, Meeting: Ingleside Home, 70 Harvard Place; Niagara Machine & Tool Works Factory, 631 & 683 Northland Avenue; and Westminster House, 419 Monroe Street.
5. Black Rock Lock - the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers Invites the Preservation Board to Participate in a Section 106 Review of a Redevelopment Project at the Black Rock Lock and Adjacent 3.45-Acre Reservation.

V. Certificate Activity - Board Action Required

6. 140 North Pearl Street - Replace a Window on the Front Facade.

RESULT:	APPROVED [7 TO 1]
MOVER:	Gwen Howard
SECONDER:	Ruth Bryant
AYES:	McDonnell, Gilbert, Gurney, Howard, Lander, Robinson, Bryant
NAYS:	John Laping
EXCUSED:	Richard Lippes

7. 105 Elmwood Avenue - Erect a Blade Sign.

The Preservation Board approved the project on the condition that the sign bracket be simplified, with a requirement that revised plans be submitted to staff for review.

RESULT:	APPROVED WITH CONDITIONS [7 TO 0]
MOVER:	Terrence Robinson
SECONDER:	John Laping
AYES:	McDonnell, Gilbert, Gurney, Howard, Laping, Robinson, Bryant
ABSTAIN:	Eric Lander
EXCUSED:	Richard Lippes

8. 14 North Street - Adjust a 3/28/2017 Approval of a Slate Roof Replacement with a Synthetic Slate Roof, to Allow for an Asphalt Shingle Roof Replacement in Lieu of Synthetic Slate.

The Preservation Board approved the project on the condition that the terra cotta ridge cap be salvaged and reinstalled or replaced in kind with the same or like material.

RESULT:	APPROVED WITH CONDITIONS [7 TO 1]
AYES:	McDonnell, Gilbert, Gurney, Howard, Laping, Lander, Bryant
NAYS:	Terrence Robinson
EXCUSED:	Richard Lippes

VI. Certificates of No Effect

9. 90 Prospect Avenue - Replace an Asphalt Shingle Roof in Kind.
10. 40 Elmwood Avenue - Replace an Asphalt Shingle Roof in Kind.
11. 371 Delaware Avenue - Replace an Asphalt Shingle Roof in Kind.
12. 43 Hager Street - Make in Kind Repairs to a Front Porch.
13. 180 Butler Avenue - Make in Kind Repairs to the Upper and Lower Front Porches.

VII. Old Business

14. 205 Linwood Avenue - Add Lighting to a Building Exterior.

Tabled at the applicant's request.

RESULT:	TABLED
Next: 12/21/2017 3:00 PM	

15. 185 Allen Street - Comprehensively Rehabilitate the Front Facade (Remove and Replace Non-Original Storefront, Provide New Aluminum-Framed/Double-Glazed Storefront, Add Wood Knee Wall with Decorative Moldings, Install Four Wall Sconces, and Replace Upper Level Fiberglass Windows with Aluminum-Clad Windows), and Install an Internally Illuminated Blade Sign.

Tabled at the applicant's request.

RESULT:	TABLED
Next: 12/21/2017 3:00 PM	

16. 510 Delaware Avenue - Replace the Frame and Sign Face on an Existing Pole Sign.

Tabled at the applicant's request.

RESULT:	TABLED
Next: 12/21/2017 3:00 PM	

17. 306 Main Street - Install a Blade Sign with an Electronic Message Center (EMC).

The Preservation Board denied the project on the basis that the proposed Electronic Message Board (EMC) failed to meet the Secretary of the Interior Standards and Guidelines, per the approval standards of the City Code, Section 337-20, Criteria for Review, with the understanding that a revised proposal which met the standards would be grounds for reconsideration of the application. The Preservation Board considered the following standard in undertaking its review: "Not Recommended: Using inappropriately scaled signs and logos or other types

of signs that obscure, damage, or destroy remaining character-defining features of the historic building."

RESULT:	DENIED [UNANIMOUS]
MOVER:	Don Gilbert
SECONDER:	Sam Gurney
AYES:	McDonnell, Gilbert, Gurney, Howard, Laping, Lander, Robinson, Bryant
EXCUSED:	Richard Lippes

18. 419 Linwood Avenue - Erect a Front Porch, Install Stone Veneer on Tower, and Install Brick and Fiber Cement Siding on Facade.

The Preservation Board tabled the item to give the applicant an opportunity to present alternatives to the proposed cultured stone veneer as a facade material, which the Preservation Board found had no parallel in the adjacent Linwood Historic District. The Preservation Board suggested consideration of brick, wood or fiber cement clapboard, fiber cement shake shingles, or uniform/dressed stone of a single color as an alternative.

RESULT:	TABLED [UNANIMOUS]
	Next: 12/21/2017 3:00 PM
MOVER:	Gwen Howard
SECONDER:	John Laping
AYES:	McDonnell, Gilbert, Gurney, Howard, Laping, Lander, Robinson, Bryant
EXCUSED:	Richard Lippes

VIII. New Business

19. 2655 Bailey Avenue - Demolish an Automotive Sales and Service Building.

The Preservation Board could not find that 2655 Bailey Avenue met any criteria for local landmark designation per City Code, Section 337-15, Criteria for Designation, and therefore voted to receive and file the item.

RESULT:	RECEIVED AND FILED [UNANIMOUS]
MOVER:	John Laping
SECONDER:	Don Gilbert
AYES:	McDonnell, Gilbert, Gurney, Howard, Laping, Lander, Robinson, Bryant
EXCUSED:	Richard Lippes

20. 82 Rees Street - Demolish a Double Unit Dwelling.

The Preservation Board voted to recommend denial of the demolition application for 82 Rees Street on the basis that the building is an intact, surviving example of the early 20th century "Buffalo Double," a vernacular housing type characteristic of the Upper West Side.

RESULT:	DENIED [UNANIMOUS]
MOVER:	Eric Lander, Vice Chairman
SECONDER:	Terrence Robinson
AYES:	McDonnell, Gilbert, Gurney, Howard, Laping, Lander, Robinson, Bryant
EXCUSED:	Richard Lippes

City Clerk